

## PARAPSYCHOLOGY AND HUMANISTIC PSYCHOLOGY: THE EDUCATIONAL INTERFACE

STANLEY KRIPPNER

As one attempts to discern the connection between humanistic psychology and parapsychology, it is tempting to remain at a superficial level of analysis. For example, several parapsychological papers and panel reports appear each year on the annual program of the Association for Humanistic Psychology (AHP). In addition, psychical research has been featured at AHP's international conferences in Amsterdam (in 1970), Würzburg (in 1971), Tokyo (in 1972), Paris (in 1973), Visakhapatnam (in 1974), and Cuernavaca (in 1975). Division 32 (Humanistic Psychology) of the American Psychological Association schedules parapsychological presentations each year at the annual conventions of APA.

Psychologists and psychotherapists who identify their approach as "humanistic" tend to be more open-minded concerning the validity of parapsychological occurrences than psychologists with other orientations. Colleges which include a significant proportion of "humanistic psychologists" on their faculties almost invariably offer courses in psychical research. However, the relationship between parapsychology and humanistic psychology exists at a deeper level (Krippner & Murphy, 1973) and reflects the key theoretical concepts of humanistic psychology outlined by Charlotte Bühler (1971).

1. *The study of the person as a whole.* Psi, the subject matter of parapsychology, can be seen to operate in frequent reported personal experiences which defy an easy explanation. A person may dream of an impending catastrophe before it happens. A "psychic healer" may be involved in the remarkable recovery of a person from a fatal disease. These personal experiences represent a complex configuration of forces, very few of which are taken into account in the typical laboratory experiment with extrasensory perception (ESP) or psychokinesis (PK). Tests with ESP cards and with PK influences on dice reflect the behavioristic influence which dominated American psychology for many years, placing an emphasis on the observed

response of a subject while neglecting intervening variables of "the person as a whole." The studies which have been reported correlating psychic ability with personality traits (e.g., Schmeidler, 1960) are a promising beginning in the task of studying the whole person and investigating some of the variables which are seen to operate in a real-life situation when ESP or PK occurs.

2. *The course of human life as a whole.* There are several clues in the anecdotal and experimental literature which would be worthwhile pursuing if developmental history and longitudinal study approaches were to be applied in parapsychology. One of the most outstanding subjects in J. B. Rhine's early research was a young girl who, at the age of nine, made "hits" on all 25 guesses in a deck of ESP cards (Reeves & Rhine, 1942). It has been suggested that children may be better subjects in psychical research than adults because children's ESP and PK abilities have not yet been stifled by a critical society (Krippner, 1963). The autobiographical writings of Eileen J. Garrett (e.g., 1968) contain considerable material of value to the investigation of psychic development over the course of human life.

Garrett (1970) has recalled how she was often considered a "nuisance" as a child because she could tell when people were lying and when they were telling the truth. She has stated, "As I look back now, I smile over the things I did, but then I was living in a world nobody else understood." Despite the provocative indications that psi may change over the years of a person's life, there are few longitudinal studies of gifted subjects in the parapsychological literature,\* nor are there comparative studies which compare ESP or PK performance of people at different ages. K. Ramakrishna Rao (1966:27) has lamented, "Unfortunately, the published experimental reports do not often involve an assessment of the subjects."

3. *Human existence and intentionality.* The parapsychological literature and the writings of humanistic psychologists overlap in the discussion of intentionality, specifically in the concepts of "sense of self" and "free will." A. H. Maslow (1956) has described how the person with a fragile sense of self typically possesses a limited capacity for self-determination. The self-concept of high-scoring ESP subjects was found to be important by Gertrude Schmeidler and R.A. McConnell (1958) who administered the Rorschach technique to subjects in an ESP study. High-scoring subjects differed from low-scoring subjects in that the former displayed more of a readiness to accept new experi-

---

\* The work of Berthold E. Schwarz (e.g., 1974) stands as a welcome exception to this generalization.

ences as well as a lack of rigidity in perception and a high degree of "psychological self-sufficiency."

The concept of precognition is thought by some people to threaten the idea of free will, but Rao (1966:182-183) has argued that parapsychological data support free will in several ways: (a) The fact that it is possible to be aware of objects and events that are not in existence now but will exist sometime in the future makes it absurd to maintain that an external event determines or causes everything that comes into our awareness; (b) PK data indicate that human volitions can cause changes in external objects—a reversal of the position that external forces account for the internal processes of the mind.

4. *Motivation and goal setting.* The importance of identifying human goals in humanistic psychology studies is echoed by the attention paid to motivation by some parapsychologists. J. B. Rhine (1964) once investigated the personal motives of seven gifted subjects to make high ESP scores; in each case, there was an "exceptionally strong" drive to score highly. Schmeidler's experiments (1946) with "believers" and "non-believers" in ESP indicate that the "believers" generally tended to make high scores, possible because of their personal motivation. The non-believers tended to produce not merely chance results, but to "psi-miss," making low scores which were statistically significant in the opposite direction; this phenomenon may have been related to personal motives against identifying the correct ESP card.

Rao (1966:59) has summarized the data in this area by stating, "It would seem, therefore, that religious values, the self-confidence of the subject, and the novelty of the test conditions, insofar as they are found to contribute to the success of the subject, may help to raise his motivation." Rao suggests that just about anyone may become a high-scoring subject for a psi experiment if the researcher determines how to maximize that subject's motivation.

5. *The integrative process.* Humanistic psychologists see one's integrative process as a basic human potentiality, a process which orders and unifies one's other potentials. The ordering of values and the search for meaning assist the integrative process; ESP and PK abilities can emerge from this integration. Schmeidler (1960) reported a Rorschach study involving 1,062 subjects rated as "well-adjusted" or "poorly-adjusted." She found that the "well-adjusted" subjects who "believed" in ESP scored significantly higher than the "well-adjusted" subjects who did not "believe" in ESP. There were no significant differences between the "poorly-adjusted" groups. Schmeidler (1960:89) concluded that the element of belief in ESP "will be more pronounced for subjects whose social adjustment is good than for those whose social adjustment is poor."

For many highly developed psychic sensitives, the integration of paranormal events into their personal worldview and behavioral repertoire represents a developmental challenge. In his extensive psychological study of Eileen J. Garrett, Ira Progoff (1964) came to the conclusion that she was a remarkably integrated individual and that her mediumistic "controls" played an important part in this integration. Progoff's study serves as a model for other humanistic psychologists to emulate as they examine psychic sensitives from a scientific perspective.

6. *Creativity and goal-setting.* In the previously discussed basic theoretical concepts of humanistic psychology, two have been presented, representing areas in which parapsychology could benefit from a study of such writers as Charlotte Bühler, A. H. Maslow, Rollo May, and Carl Rogers. Three have been presented in which there are overlapping areas of mutual interest. The remaining three theoretical concepts represent contributions which parapsychology may make to humanistic psychology. Creativity, more than any other human behavior, is seen as a manifestation of Ludwig von Bertalanffy's theory (1966) that the human brain represents an "open system" with certain freedoms of operation and potentials for change. Parapsychological data also support this notion. J. B. Rhine (1935) has written of the mind's occasional ability to function independently of the physical body, a possibility most dramatically expressed by subjects in "out-of-body" experiments (Swann, 1975).

In addition, there are several experiments which demonstrate a relationship between psychic ability and creative ability (e.g., Honor-ton, 1967; Schmeidler, 1964). A number of anecdotal reports from the lives of gifted people are often cited to link psi and creativity (e.g., Dreistadt, 1971). This idea was followed up by Thelma Moss (1969) who found that artists in an ESP study made higher scores than non-artists.

7. *Person-to-person relationships in psychotherapy.* Humanistic psychologists regard the personal relationship between therapist and patient more important than the specific techniques used or the specific interpretations of behavior proposed. This position is supported by experimental data which show that the person-to-person relationship is important even in behavioristically-oriented therapy which de-emphasizes the therapist-patient relationship (Ryan & Gizynski, 1971).

In taking the positions that they do, humanistic psychologists should be aware of the possibility that their patients may have telepathic experiences concerning the personal lives of their therapists. There is an abundance of psychoanalytic literature on psi in therapist-patient

relationships (e.g., Ehrenwald, 1948; Ullman, 1959) that would be pertinent to the humanistically-oriented psychotherapist.

8. *Feeling, experience, and education.* Humanistic education stresses what Carl Rogers (1969) calls "self-reliant learning," which acknowledges the learner's emotional as well as intellectual experiences. A number of parapsychological experiments indicate that successful teaching may have a psi component. For example, M. L. Anderson and R. A. White (1958) found that students who liked their teachers scored higher on ESP card-guessing tests (and received better grades) than students who did not like their teachers. Humanistic psychologists stress experiential education which could well have a psi component. Instead of scoffing at a student who reports an "out-of-body" experience or a telepathic dream, the teacher could deal with the report openly and authentically, using it to help the student enrich the knowledge of oneself. It would not even be necessary to pass judgment on the validity of the report, initially. The elicitation of extraordinary life episodes by teachers is vital if children are to recognize and appreciate "peak experiences." Maslow (1971:170-171) notes, "It looks as if any experience of real excellence, of real perfection, of any moving toward the perfect justice or toward perfect values tends to produce a peak experience." As examples, he cites "peak experiences" obtained through music, mathematics, personal relationships and childbirth. He concludes "We may be able to use them as a model by which to re-evaluate history teaching or any other kind of teaching (1971:178)." To Maslow, learning one's identity is an essential part of the educational process. If education fails at this task, it is without significant merit.

#### UBIQUITY

An increasing number of colleges are allowing selected students to write Masters' theses on a parapsychological topic. This is often done at the two state colleges most closely associated with humanistic psychology: West Georgia College (Carrollton, GA) and California State College, Sonoma (Rohnert Park, CA). The Masters of Arts' (MA) degree programs at West Georgia College and California State College, Sonoma (CSCS),\* include standard psychology courses, introductory courses in parapsychology, and advanced research seminars in parapsychology.

---

\* CSCS offers both an "internal" MA degree and an "external" MA degree. In the latter instance, very few courses are taken; the students do a great deal of independent study and supervised research for which they obtain credit.

The program at CSCS is facilitated in many ways by Ubiquity, a campus organization. Ubiquity has been defined (Muehe, 1974) as: ". . . a campus organization dedicated to promoting scientific and scholarly investigations into parapsychological events. It is Ubiquity's philosophy that the crossfertilization of ideas between the physical and biological sciences and the social sciences, humanities, and spiritual disciplines will breed evolutionary, if not revolutionary insights. . . . An information center has been formed in order to compile a directory of researchers and psychics in the area and to gather reference material regarding parapsychological research."

Ubiquity sponsored and coordinated a "Psychic Studies Year" at CSCS in 1974-1975. The "Psychic Studies Year" was described (Muehe, 1974) as ". . . a time for students and faculty to look at psychic phenomena from an interdisciplinary approach. The year will be devoted to parapsychological inquiry from many perspectives. . . ." Among the courses scheduled to include material about psi for "Psychic Studies Year" at CSCS were:

1. *Anthropology Department*: Psychological Anthropology
2. *Astronomy Department*: Cosmology and Extraterrestrial Intelligence
3. *Biology Department*: Human Species
4. *CSCS Extension*
  - a. Self-hypnosis
  - b. Parapsychology and the Healing Experience
  - c. Parapsychology and Psychotherapy
  - d. Paranormal Physics
5. *English Department*: The Psychic Journey
6. *Expressive Arts Department*
  - a. Psychic Awareness
  - b. History of Astrology
7. *Philosophy Department*
  - a. Epistemology
  - b. Metaphysics
8. *Physics Department*
  - a. Descriptive Physics
  - b. People's Electronics
  - c. Selected Topics in Physics: Paranormal Phenomena
  - d. Special Studies: Student-Initiated Research
9. *Psychology Department*
  - a. Introduction to Parapsychology
  - b. Myths, Dreams, and Symbols
  - c. The Psychology of Yoga
  - d. Seminar in Za-zen
  - e. Introduction to Psychological Research and Basic Statistics

- f. Perception and Cognition
- g. Neuropsychology
- h. Psychopharmacology
- i. The Psychodynamics of Energy
- j. Psychology of Boundary
- k. Psychic Studies Symposia

During "Psychic Studies Year," a psychic counseling service opened in the student health clinic. The psychic counseling service was staffed by psychology students working under the direction of a faculty member in the psychology department. The students who came for counseling consisted of those who felt they had experienced paranormal phenomena (e.g., precognitive dreams, poltergeist phenomena) which were difficult to explain with their model of reality or to integrate with their view of the world. Counseling consisted of offering various explanations of the phenomena, including one in parapsychological terms, and helping the students to determine the meaning of the reported phenomena in their current life situation.

#### A PROPOSED BACHELORS PROGRAM

A bachelor of arts degree (B.A.) in psychology with an emphasis on parapsychology has been proposed by Ubiquity (1974), the student psychical research society at CSCS. The rationale for the program is presented in the following way:

"The study of parapsychology, one of the frontiers of consciousness, is coming into its own as a legitimate discipline. Parapsychological organizations are expanding, and established research institutes are investigating such occurrences as extrasensory perception, psychokinesis, and unorthodox healing methods. As interest in psychic phenomena increases, the need for well-prepared researchers grows proportionately. Presently, there are about five colleges in the United States that offer undergraduate degrees in parapsychology. The only one of these schools west of Minnesota, John F. Kennedy University, is not accredited. California State College, Sonoma, offers unique advantages—instructors knowledgeable in the field, accessibility to Bay area resources—that render it amenable to a program in parapsychology. Thus, it is reasonable to assume that the majority of prospective parapsychological researchers in California would be interested in participating in such a program at California State College, Sonoma."

The objectives of the major are presented:

1. To prepare the student for further study of psychic phenomena through the development of a well-rounded psychology student who

also has a basic understanding of the physical sciences and is well-versed in experimental procedure.

2. To broaden the perspective of the student of traditional psychology regarding human behavior through investigation of parapsychological events.

3. To enhance a progressive academic environment that encourages research in and discussion of the frontiers of knowledge.

4. To integrate the scientific and metaphysical or religious world views in order to create a synergetic perspective.

The following requirements for the proposed parapsychology major are listed:

1. *Core courses*

- a. Introduction to Psychological Research and Basic Statistics (8 units)
- b. Physiological Psychology or Developmental Psychology (4 units)
- c. Neuropsychology (8 units)
- d. One course in Psychological Theory (4 units)
  - 1) Perception and Cognition
  - 2) Abnormal Behavior
  - 3) Neuroses and Personality
  - 4) The Psychoses
  - 5) Personality
  - 6) Theoretical Systems of Psychology
  - 7) Seminar in Theoretical Psychology
  - 8) Seminar in Phenomenology
- e. One course in growth processes (4 units)
  - 1) Awareness Processes
  - 2) Dynamics of Human Behavior
  - 3) Seminar in Myths, Dreams, and Symbols
  - 4) Seminar in Creativity
  - 5) Seminar in Psychology of the Mural Process
  - 6) Seminar in Interpersonal Behavior
  - 7) Group Processes
  - 8) Seminar in the Psychology of the Body
  - 9) Psychology of Yoga
  - 10) Seminar in Dimensions of Asian Psychology
  - 11) Seminar in the Psychology of India
  - 12) Seminar in the Psychology of Asia
  - 13) Seminar in Za-zen
  - 14) Seminar in Selected Topics in Self-Exploration
  - 15) Advanced Group Processes
  - 16) The Gestalt Process



- f. Introduction to Parapsychology (4 units)
  - g. Psychic Studies Symposium (2 units)
  - h. One course in introductory physics
    - 1) Introduction to Physics I, II, and III
    - 2) General Physics
  - i. Selected Topics in Physics: Paranormal Phenomena (3 units)
  - j. Principles of Life Sciences
2. *Supporting subjects*
- a. One course in Western thought (3 units)
    - 1) Advanced Logic
    - 2) Philosophy of Science
    - 3) Epistemology
    - 4) Philosophy of Mind
    - 5) Phenomenology
    - 6) Topics in Logic, Epistemology, Methodology
    - 7) Nineteenth Century Philosophy
    - 8) Continental Rationalism
    - 9) Twentieth Century Philosophy
    - 10) British Empiricists
    - 11) Greek Philosophy
    - 12) Topics in the History of Philosophy
    - 13) Medieval Philosophy
    - 14) Kant
    - 15) Philosophy of Man
    - 16) Seminar in Logic and Epistemology
    - 17) Seminar in History of Philosophy
  - b. One course in non-Western Thought
    - 1) Afro-American Folklore
    - 2) Mexican-American Myth and Art
    - 3) Mexican-American Folklore
    - 4) Comparative Ethnic Folklore
    - 5) Asian-American Folklore
    - 6) Cults and Sacred Movements of the Native American
    - 7) Native American Philosophy Systems
    - 8) Psychological Anthropology
    - 9) Cultures of the Pacific
    - 10) History of Chinese Thought
    - 11) Eastern Philosophy
    - 12) Non-Western Speculative Systems
    - 13) Psychology of Yoga
    - 14) Asian Psychology
    - 15) Psychology of India
    - 16) Seminar in the Psychology of Asia

- 17) Seminar in Za-zen
- c. Three units of independent research (Nemec & Muehe, 1975) or three units in an associated scientific area.
- 3. *Summary (124 units needed for B.A. degree)*
  - a. Core courses
    - 1) Psychology courses (34 units)
    - 2) Other courses (7 to 9 units)
    - 3) Supporting subjects (9 units)
  - b. General education courses (40 units)
  - c. Electives (32 to 34 units)

Although the number of college courses on the topic of parapsychology is increasing, I am ambivalent about the benefits of this movement to the field. In giving guest lectures at colleges and universities around the country, I am often welcomed by faculty members who teach courses on psychical research, who tell me how popular their classes are and how pleased the university financial officers are to have new money-making courses in evening school, the extension division, and adult education. Unfortunately, I rarely find an instructor who I consider qualified to teach a course in parapsychology. It is true that the instructors are highly motivated, well-meaning people, but they have little awareness of the literature in parapsychology, the history of psychical research, or the basic foundations of scientific method. These instructors frequently include such topics in the course outline as astrology, Kirlian photography, palmistry, pyramids, Tarot cards, UFO's, witchcraft, Yoga, and other topics which, although worthy of study in their own right, are only tangentially related to scientific parapsychology. For texts, these instructors will often select *Supernature* (Watson, 1973), or *Psychic Discoveries Behind the Iron Curtain* (Ostrander & Schroeder, 1970). Further, they often have no acquaintance with curriculum guides in the field such as those prepared by Ashby (1972), McConnell (1971), Rogo (1973), and White and Dale (1973).

I am also ambivalent in regard to the laboratory experiments being conducted in parapsychology by students in these rapidly emerging courses. Psychical research involves a complicated set of procedures, yet many neophyte experimenters blithely go their way without due regard for eliminating sensory cueing, the stacking effect, or other possible sources of artifact that were identified by parapsychologists decades ago. I sometimes think that poor research in parapsychology is worse than no research at all. Poor research, if it gets published, only adds one more datum to the pile of work that someday must be done over again. In the meantime, students are deluded into thinking that

they are following scientific methods and advancing the cause of parapsychology.

#### HUMANISTIC PSYCHOLOGY INSTITUTE

In 1971, a group of psychology professors from CSCS, led by Dr. Eleanor Criswell, formulated plans for the Humanistic Psychology Institute (HPI). It became the educational wing of the Association for Humanistic Psychology (AHP) and its aims have been described (Pokinghorne, *et al.*, 1975) as: ". . . to further research in humanistic psychology and to offer an educational program at the doctoral level in psychology. The Institute grants a Doctor of Philosophy degree. . . to its Research Fellows who (1) demonstrate substantial scholarship and high attainment in psychology, particularly in the humanistic orientation to psychology, and (2) have mastered the ability to accomplish and effectively communicate research in humanistic psychology."

The HPI program has been described (Pokinghorne, 1975) as one which differs from other doctoral programs in psychology in that it focuses on the humanistic orientation toward psychology. This orientation includes a number of understandings and attitudes about the investigation of persons and the means used to promote their wholeness. Some expressions of these understandings and attitudes are:

1. Human life is unique and can best be understood by centering attention on the experiencing person.
2. Knowledge of persons comes from the investigation of individual, exceptional, and unpredicted experiences as well as the regular, universal, and conforming experiences.
3. Knowledge of persons comes from focusing on such topics as choice, self-realization, spontaneity, love, creativity, valuing, responsibility, authenticity, meaning, transcendental experience, and courage, even though these topics do not easily lend themselves to experimental research methods.
4. The understanding of human action needs to include factors such as intentionality and personal values.

Humanistic psychology is concerned with the development of methods which enlarge and expand human experiences and which emphasize the integration of the whole person. Its commitment is to psychology as a science and as an art; it rejects only those assumptions which restrict inquiry and interfere with a total view of human experience.

In its official report on HPI in 1974, the Special Committee on the Approval of Degree Programs of the State of California stated that, "The process of learning in HPI is a fresh breeze in the academic world." Approval to grant degrees was unanimously granted by members of the Committee and HPI is now applying for accreditation from the Western Association of Colleges and Schools. The procedures which make HPI unique are independent study and an absence of residency requirements. The rationale for these procedures has been stated (Pokinghorne, *et al.*, 1975):

1. Most graduate school programs operate with assumptions which make independent, learner-centered education nearly impossible. In these programs, it is assumed that students cannot be trusted to pursue their own scientific and professional learnings.

2. Another limiting characteristic of most graduate programs is residency requirements which exclude many older, experienced persons already involved in professional commitments, families, and jobs. Looking at graduate education as an activity that takes place at a particular time and place is wasteful and elitist—excluding many fertile untapped learning resources that exist outside the university campus.

Therefore, HPI takes the position (Pokinghorne, *et al.*, 1975) that "by establishing set courses, credit and residency requirements through which all must pass, graduate students are often discouraged and punished for pursuing their own interests."

Presently, there are about 250 Research Fellows at HPI pursuing Ph.D. degrees. They devote about 40 hours per week to the accomplishment of their learning goals and dissertations. They live in areas throughout the United States and several foreign countries, using those learning resources and training opportunities wherever they are located, which are most appropriate to their learning objectives. They have been admitted to HPI on the basis of a written application, a personal interview, and completion of a learning contract with one of HPI's five "home faculty members" at a program planning seminar. HPI Research Fellows range in age from 25 to 80; the average age is 38. Presently 60 per cent of the Research Fellows are males and 40 per cent are females, representing a variety of racial and ethnic backgrounds.

Research Fellows work with a doctoral committee composed of one "home faculty member" and two "field faculty members." The "field faculty members" share a Fellow's interests and are able to give time for the completion of specific learning assignments in the Fellow's learning

contract. There are four major decisions to be made by the doctoral committee:

1. Each member must approve the Fellow's learning contract as developed at the program planning seminar or as amended.

2. Following at least three semesters in the HPI program, a Fellow may apply for candidacy status. This step must be approved by the committee and indicates that the Fellow has mastered the preliminary knowledge set down in the learning contract and is ready to begin work on the dissertation.

3. Following at least three semesters of work on the dissertation, the Fellow may ask for its approval by the committee. The approval may be granted immediately, upon submission of a revised dissertation, or not at all.

4. The committee recommends to the Institute that the Fellow be granted a Ph.D. degree.

There are two HPI Research Fellows\* specializing in parapsychology. The learning contracts of both students specify that the Fellows demonstrate competence in psychology at the graduate level, with special emphasis upon history and systems of psychology (including the humanistic orientation to psychology), developmental psychology, physiological psychology, personality theory, experimental design, and statistics. In addition, knowledge is required of the history of psychical research, experimental approaches in parapsychology, and sleight-of-hand (so that fraud among parapsychological subjects can be detected). Several members of the Parapsychological Association have joined HPI as "field faculty members"; their number includes Robert Brier, Charles Honorton, Thelma Moss, Gertrude Schmeidler, and Montague Ullman. Therefore, a new Ph.D. program exists which allows students to specialize in parapsychology. Of course, a number of programs are already in existence, most significantly those at Andhra University, India, City College of New York, and the University of Freiburg, West Germany.

The State of California's Special Committee on Approval of Degree Programs, upon approving HPI's Ph.D. program in 1974, presented its impressions of the program (Gustler, 1974):

"The student is motivated for excellence by several factors. The project is of his own choosing and he is deeply involved in it. He receives reinforcement as well as criticism from his committee. The aim

---

\* E. Douglas Dean and James Terry.

of making a contribution to a humanistic society through demonstration (such as founding a half-way house) or through communicating to others through readable publication (encouraged by HPI) is another motivation for excellence. Some of the projects are much more impressive than the average doctoral thesis.

"The opportunity to select faculty with whom students could work closely was indicated as one compelling motive for entering this institute. Description of projects already in motion indicated much hard work, resourcefulness, and a deep devotion to project goals. The overall impression was one of serious concern to develop a project, not just to 'get a degree,' but hopefully to make a contribution that will help people in some small way, yet at the same time meet the students' own needs and plans. The committee members found the faculty to be enthusiastic and idealistic but keenly aware of some pitfalls, and that they appeared to be dedicated realists. The stated aim of fostering a facilitative, trusting climate of learning has been achieved to a surprising degree."

In conclusion, the Committee stated, "The aim of promoting graduate research of a creative nature and high quality as a contribution to a humanistic society is being achieved through the project method."

#### PSI SEARCH

A number of students at California State College, Sonoma, as well as some Research Fellows at the Humanistic Psychology Institute, assisted in the development of *Psi Search*. From January 30 to March 30, 1975, *Psi Search* was open to the general public at the California Museum of Science and Industry, the first exhibit on parapsychology to be housed in a science museum. However, two years of planning and preparation had preceded this exhibit, about which the *Los Angeles Times* (January 30, 1975) commented, ". . . most interesting. . . material on psi (has been) accepted at a science museum, an institution that deals in irrefutable fact."

Norma L. Bowles served as the producer of *Psi Search*; Fran Hynds was its director, and Richard Byrne was its designer. I was appointed chairperson of the scientific advisory committee, and was assisted by D. L. Keene, Gertrude Schmeidler, Charles Tart, J. G. Pratt, Jule Eisenbud, Rober Morris, and Robert Van de Castle. Joanna Morris served as coordinator for the Parapsychological Association which decided to cooperate in *Psi Search's* production by decision of the PA executive board in late 1974.

*Psi Search* was important because it was the first overview of the scientific study of psi to be presented in a science museum. It served an educational function, being designed for the general public to assist it to become acquainted with parapsychological research and to learn the need for supporting the field. The exhibit was divided into two parts:

1. *Psi* touched on the historical and cultural perspective leading to the emergence of parapsychology. It reported on the main areas of 40 years of scientific psi research by describing 15 experiments—all of which had previously been published in referred journals.

2. *Search* explored some of the possible ways in which ESP and PK permeate daily life as well as implications for the future.

Among the California State College, Sonoma, graduate students who worked on the exhibit were James L. Hickman (who served as technical director) and John Hubacher (who served as a writer and researcher). HPI Research Fellows who assisted in the production of *Psi Search* included Douglas Dean, Bam Price, and James Terry.

In February, 1975, J. B. Rhine visited *Psi Search*. He later wrote the producer of *Psi Search* a letter in which he stated:

"I cannot say too often or too strongly that I think the *Psi Search* Exhibit you and your colleagues have developed is a most competent and successful achievement. You have well fulfilled your high aim of broad coverage and good illustrative representation.

"While you have done well in balancing and outlining the progress in parapsychology, you have allowed ample opportunity for future growth and even for later correction if you find reason to alter some item in the wide coverage you have displayed."

"It is a timely event to make available, first, in this distinguished museum, and then, in due course, for all others that may wish to share it, a subject so much in need of this sober, factual photographic display as parapsychology in 1975. There are many signs of this timeliness. The historians are seriously at work on the subject. Sociologists are focusing on its innovative impact. Psychologists and psychiatrists are examining it for its meaning for their fields. It is time for all to have a good look such as you have made possible."

"As it circulates month by month around the leading museums of the country, and grows with the subject it represents, it should, by the time it returns—let us say five years from now—be new enough that all will want to see what progress has been made and what new faces and fresh accomplishments have been added."

"It is surely one of the good educational achievements in this field, and I am personally grateful to those who have contributed so

much—first of all, of course, yourself. One of the outstanding features, it seems to me, has been the degree of cooperation you have received.”

Later in the year, *Psi Search* sponsored a workshop on “Parapsychology in the Classroom and the Research Lab” for the purpose of stimulating the dissemination of accurate information about psi. In a brochure announcing the meeting, several points of concern to the workshop leaders were outlined (Hynds, *et al.*, 1975):

1. Self-appointed “authorities” have disseminated unsubstantiated data and gross exaggerations about psi as if they were fact.

2. Persons who are associated with psi work in some way, or persons working the the field themselves have different theories about what psi is and how it operates. Unfortunately, sometimes some of these people also present unsubstantiated data on their hypotheses as if they were fact.

3. Results of research done under carefully controlled laboratory conditions have not been easily accessible or available.

4. Anecdotal information about reported spontaneous occurrences of psi is more interesting to most people who wish to learn about the field than is scientific fact, and such information is more easily distorted in the telling.

5. The dissemination of misinformation is perpetuated in that most of the persons who have presented themselves as instructors have no standard qualifications and credentials, but are themselves self-taught by what they think is accurate information.

In August, 1975, the exhibit moved to Santa Barbara for the annual convention of the PA; from there it began a lengthy tour of various science museums around the country under the sponsorship of the Smithsonian Institution.

#### CONCLUSION

Institutions of higher education which include a humanistically-oriented psychology department present fertile ground for courses centering around parapsychology. However, these courses need to be developed with care and concern or they will often turn into an embarrassment for psychical research rather than an asset. If an instructor insists upon including material in the course which is peripheral to scientific parapsychology, perhaps the word “parapsychology” should be omitted from the course title. Better terms might be “Psychic Studies” or “Occult Studies”; the latter term has been defined by McConnell (1971) as “dealing with psychological relation-



ships whose reality, as manifest, is accepted by a sizeable group of adults but denied or ignored in the orthodox belief systems of the prevailing culture." McConnell includes parapsychology in his list of occult topics, but also includes such areas as mysticism, astrology, black magic, and UFOs.

At long last, parapsychology is making serious inroads into the mainstream of scientific inquiry. As an inevitable result of this development, educational correlates are developing. Because humanistic psychology presents an openness to psychical research lacking in most other psychological systems, a dialogue between these disciplines is essential. Only as each area educates the other, can common progress be made toward a common goal—discovery of the full range of human potentials and their beneficial use.

#### REFERENCES

- Anderson, M. L., & White, R. A.: "ESP Score Level in Relation to Students' Attitude toward Teacher-agents Acting Simultaneously," *Journal of Parapsychology*, 1958, 22, p. 20-28.
- Ashby, R. H.: *The Guide Book for the Study of Psychical Research* (New York: Weiser, 1972).
- Bühler, C.: "Basic Theoretical Concepts of Humanistic Psychology." *American Psychologist*, 1971, 26, p. 378-386.
- Dreistadt, R.: "The Prophetic Achievements of Geniuses and Types of Extrasensory Perception." *Psychology*, 1971, 8, p. 27-40.
- Ehrenwald, J.: *Telepathy and Medical Psychology* (New York: Norton, 1948).
- Garrett, E. J.: *Many Voices: The Autobiography of a Medium* (New York: Putnam's Sons, 1969).
- Garrett, E. J.: Interview, *Psychic*, 1970, 1, p. 4-7, 32-37.
- Gustler, P., et al.: *Report of the Special Committee on Approval of the Degree Programs at the Humanistic Psychology Institute, San Francisco*. Sacramento, CA: State of California, 1974.
- Honorton, C.: "Creativity and Precognition Scoring Level." *Journal of Parapsychology*, 1967, 31, p. 29-42.
- Hynds, F., et al.: *Parapsychology in the Classroom and the Research Lab*. Los Angeles: *Psi Search*, 1975. Photo-offset.
- Krippner, S.: "Creativity and Psychic Phenomena," *Gifted Child Quarterly*, 1963, 7, p. 51-63.
- Krippner, S., & Murphy, G.: "Humanistic Psychology and Parapsychology," *Journal of Humanistic Psychology*, 1973, 13, p. 3-24.
- McConnell, R.: *ESP Curriculum Guide* (New York: Simon & Schuster, 1971).
- Maslow, A. H.: "Defense and Growth," *Merrill-Palmer Quarterly*, 1956, 3, p. 36-47.
- Maslow, A. H.: *The Farther Reaches of Human Nature* (New York: Viking, 1971).
- Moss, T.: "ESP Effects in Artists Contrasted with 'Nonartists,'" *Journal of Parapsychology*, 1969, 33, p. 57-69.
- Muehe, J.: *Psychic Studies Year*. Rohnert Park, CA: California State College, Sonoma, 1974. Pamphlet.
- Nemec, D. W., & Muehe, J. E.: *A Student's Guide for Conducting Research Projects*. Rohnert Park, CA: California State College, Sonoma, 1975. Mimeographed.
- Ostrander, S., & Schroeder, L.: *Psychic Discoveries Behind the Iron Curtain*. (Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall, 1970).

- Pokinghorne, D., et al.: *The Humanistic Psychology Institute*. San Francisco: Humanistic Psychology Institute, 1975. Pamphlet.
- Progoff, I. *Image of an Oracle* (New York: Helix, 1964).
- Rao, K. R.: *Experimental Parapsychology: A Review and Interpretation* (Springfield, IL: Thomas, 1966).
- Reeves, M. P., & Rhine, J. B.: "Exceptional Scores in ESP Tests and Conditions: I. The Case of Lillian," *Journal of Parapsychology*, 1942, 6, p. 164-173.
- Rhine, J. B.: *Extra-sensory Perception* (Boston: Humphries, 1935).
- Rhine, J. B.: Private communication, 27 February 1975.
- Rhine, J. B.: "Special Motivation in some Exceptional ESP Performance," *Journal of Parapsychology*, 1964, 28, p. 41-50.
- Rogers, C. R.: *Freedom to Learn* (Columbus, OH: Merrill, 1969).
- Rogo, D. S.: *Methods and Models for Education in Parapsychology*, Parapsychological Monographs, No. 14, 1973.
- Ryan, V., & Gizynski, M.: "Behavior Therapy in Retrospect: Patients' Feelings about Their Behavior Therapies," *Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology*, 1971, 37, p. 1-9.
- Schmeidler, G. R.: "An Experiment on Precognitive Clairvoyance: IV. Precognition Scores Related to Creativity," *Journal of Parapsychology*, 1964, 28, p. 102-108.
- Schmeidler, G. R.: "Progress Report on Further Sheep-goat Series," *Journal of the American Society for Psychological Research*, 1946, 40, p. 34-35.
- Schmeidler, G. R.: *ESP in Relation to Rorschach Test evaluation*. Parapsychological Monographs, No. 2, 1960.
- Schmeidler, G. R., & McConnell, R. A.: *ESP and Personality Patterns* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1958).
- Schwarz, B. E.: "Psi and the Life Cycle," *Journal of the American Society of Psychosomatic Dentistry and Medicine*, 1974, 21, p. 64-69.
- Swann, I.: *To Kiss Earth Goodbye* (New York: Hawthorn, 1975).
- Ubiquity. Proposal: Bachelor of arts degree in psychology with an emphasis on parapsychology. Rohnert Park, CA: California State College, Sonoma. Mimeographed.
- Ullman, M.: "On the Occurrence of Telepathic Dreams," *Journal of the American Society for Psychological Research*, 1959, 53, p. 50-61.
- von Bertalanffy, L.: "General Systems Theory and Psychiatry," In *American Handbook of Psychiatry*, Vol. III (Arieti, S., ed.). New York: Basic Books, 1966.
- Watson, L.: *Supernature* (New York: Doubleday, 1973).
- White, R. A., & Dale, L. A.: *Parapsychology: Sources of Information* (Metuchen, NJ: Scarecrow, 1973).

## DISCUSSION

TART: I'd like to add a comment based on serving on a couple of HPI committees and one Union Graduate School committee, which has been a mixed experience. This kind of external degree program offers a real possibility for educating some people in parapsychology, but I think you'll agree with this, Stan, that the selection of the people is crucial. For a person who has already shown that he is mature and competent and knows what he wants and how to get it, it's fine, but there are a lot of other people (who might turn out to be just as productive in the end) who really need the structure and the pressure—the examination pressure and the like—of a regular

university. If we're not very clear on the selection procedure here and let people who are still sort of drifting into these much freer programs, I think the freer programs are going to be ruined.

KRIPPNER: I couldn't agree with you more, and I think the history of HPI is certainly not one that is of unblemished success. I am aware of many of the problems which existed in the earlier years of HPI. One of them involved some people that were let in but never should have been admitted. Fortunately most of those people dropped out. I think our current admission procedures are much better because now we usually require a personal interview as well as written documentation. But what you say about selection is, of course, important.

NOVILLO: When you were dealing with humanistic psychology, you were considering several aspects of the human being and parapsychology, such as "believers" and "non-believers", but you didn't mention any relation between the sex of the subjects and parapsychological phenomena. I think that the sex factor, male—female, is a very important aspect of human behavior, and consequently it must have specific and direct influence in psi activity. I think you need to take this into consideration. I think that the sex of the subject—whether man or woman—a very human aspect of human behavior—maybe it has a great relationship to parapsychological phenomena. You didn't say anything about that matter.

KRIPPNER: This is a very interesting topic but the reason I didn't say anything is because I don't think we know much about it in parapsychology. There have been a few studies which have shown sex differences. Dr. Freeman did some studies with children and noted sex differences especially in the type of target they best identified. There also were sex differences in studies by Dr. Van de Castle among the Cuna Indians in Panama. Also, in our own work at Maimonides, we found that there were some sex differences in terms of subject/agent combinations. However, I have never seen anything which has convinced me that these sex differences are anything but a product of the experimental design, experimenter effect, and the subject's culture. In other words, I don't think there is anything innate about either men or women which makes them better ESP subjects. Certainly in most cultures of the world, which are sexist, we would expect men and women to respond in different ways to ESP testing situations. One thing that has been noticed, on a cross-cultural basis, is that in England and the United States more women than men typically report ESP experiences. But in India more men than women report ESP experiences. Again, there is a cultural factor here.

NOVILLO: I do not think that man is a better or worse psychological subject than a woman. What I want to say is that their answers are different as Dr. Freeman has shown in his research throughout several years and I too, in PK experiments as I explained before.

KRIPPNER: Favoring which sex?

NOVILLO: The boys or men yielded higher results, if there wasn't an emotional-conditioning situation.

KRIPPNER: This supports my position. In the Soviet Union, just the opposite results have been reported. It's the women who reportedly have more PK than the men insofar as the training sessions directed by V. G. Adamenko are concerned. This is an example of what I said about sex difference being more closely related to the cultural milieu or the experimental situation than to biological factors.

NOVILLO: You are correct. Maybe there is some social conditioning producing different emotional attitudes which influences the results. It is necessary to research this within different cultures and to have the sex of the subjects included as one of the variables.

KRIPPNER: Yes, I think it's very important to find out what these social and educational factors are, because this will lead us to design experiments better and choose our subjects better. Certainly one's belief system is associated with this, and to some extent the world that we believe in is the world that we live in and our abilities, psi and non-psi included, are a result of our belief system. So all of the social and educational parameters are very vital; I appreciate your bringing them to our attention.

HASTINGS: As I was listening to Dr. Krippner's discussion of his many projects, I want to reflect something about his work that I admire very much. He might have some comments on it as an educational matter. In all the years that I have known Stanley, he has served as an inspiration to a countless number of students, both graduate and undergraduate, who have not only gone through his courses, but have also taken active part in his many activities—from the research at Maimonides to working with him on journals and publications, to the *Psi Search*. We heard today that many of them are setting up courses in parapsychology at Sonoma State. It occurs to me that this is an unnoticed aspect of education in parapsychology. I wonder if you would comment on that.

KRIPPNER: Well, your words are very kind, Dr. Hastings, but you should really pay the compliment to J. B. Rhine because he was the

model for me. When I was a student he invited me down to Duke University on numerous occasions, and had me stay at his house with him and his wife. He brought me along to various research meetings, and was a constant source of inspiration to me. I have just followed the model that I learned from him. I know very well that personal interest and personal encouragement are important factors in education. I had such a good teacher myself that I am pleased that I was able to pass the motivation on to a few of my students.

RHINE: I am very grateful indeed to Stanley for his kind remarks.

PALMER: I related to the previous discussion on sex differences and I have a little data to report that might be relevant to that. A couple of years ago we did a survey at the University of Virginia among randomly selected students and townspeople in the town of Charlottesville. We asked various questions about the frequency of occurrence of various kinds of psi experiences, and also dreams and other altered states of consciousness. With regard to sex differences, the only thing we found was that women reported significantly more psychic dreams than men, but this did not generalize to waking ESP experiences. My suspicion is that the reason for this is related to the fact that the women also reported significantly better dream recall and more vivid dreams than men, and I suspect this is why the difference showed up in dreams and not in waking experiences.

KRIPPNER: Dr. Palmer has identified, I feel, the critical variable. The same thing happened in reverse at Maimonides. It's true that we found some differences in that men were the better telepathic dreamers than women in our studies, and yet when we looked at the records, it was the men who reported their dreams more fully and more completely. And this is true of dream research in general; men are the better dream reporters than women. Perhaps this is because so many dreams are sexy and bloody. Sex occurs in dreams frequently and many women in our sexist society, where women first aren't supposed to dream about these things, would hesitate to report this to complete strangers, or even blot it out of their own memories. This, of course, would inhibit the ESP from coming through because much of our target material contains sex, and violence, and very strong emotional material.

FRANKLIN: One comment I wanted to make and that was with regard to the course content in the parapsychology curriculum. I would think that there should be something in the realm of physical science in that regard, and I think that most of you would probably agree with me. In recent history in the Brain Research Lab at UCLA, it was indicated that there are some effects of frequency—FM waves

modulated by brain wave frequencies affected monkey behavior patterns—and there's a substantial amount of work that's accumulating in that area now. There are other things, such as electroreception in fish and the body fields that exist around human beings. They're fairly well known, and data is coming forward where it had not existed ten years ago. There's a new body of evidence, and it seems to me that it would be appropriate for any parapsychology curriculum to include something that would be in the realm of electrical engineering with bio-engineering overtones.

KRIPPNER: Let me comment on that because it gives me a chance to make mention of part of my paper I left out because of time, but which will be included in the printed proceedings. I've given a suggested curriculum that is now being debated at California State College, Sonoma, which will probably be implemented if the funding comes through. This is a curriculum for an undergraduate degree in parapsychology, and here are a few highlights:

Introduction to Psychological Research and Basic Statistics.

Neurophysiology.

One course on Psychological Theory.

One course on Growth Processes.

One course on Western Thought; one course on Non-Western Thought.

Selected Topics in Physics is a requirement.

One course in Introductory Physics is a requirement.

Principles of Life Sciences is a requirement.

There are some optional courses in Physics and other sciences.

This curriculum is being developed mainly by the Psychology, Physics and Philosophy Departments at Sonoma State. It has received approval in terms of being implemented, but depends on whether the state budget will have the money and whether such a curriculum is permitted legally. John Vasconcellos, a State Assemblyman, is working on these problems for us, and sees this as a possible model for the State College system. So I basically agree with you that a course in physics would be a very important basic requirement for a parapsychology curriculum. Again, it depends on who would be able to teach it. It would have to be taught properly to be of value.

TART: Stan, let me push you a little bit because we need to bring out an area of possible conflict here. Some days of the week I'm classified as a humanistic psychologist, since I teach a course on it, and I personally find the two fields quite compatible. Your paper, on a theoretical level, makes them quite compatible. But what about some real contrast?

Parapsychology as we know it, stresses objectivity, statistical analysis, and leaving your personal belief system and feelings totally out of your assessments and procedures. Humanistic psychology, as practiced, puts much more emphasis on how you *feel*. You act on the basis of your experience and your feelings and do not let your intellect get in the way. Can you see this conflict? And how do you resolve it?

KRIPPNER: Yes, I see the conflict and I think that the way that I resolve it may not be the way that other people would resolve it. Yet, I will be happy to share my feelings with you. First of all, there is absolutely nothing in terms of experimental procedures which I think runs counter to humanistic psychology. Certainly there are any number of humanistic psychologists who use statistics in their research, and any number that would want to observe phenomena closely and write clearly about them. I think the critical problem comes on the issue of leaving one's belief systems out of the experiment, the way we're told that we are supposed to do in parapsychology. Humanistic psychologists would say that this is a fallacy; one can not leave one's belief system out of the experiment. They would point to such things as the Rosenthal effect, which holds that an experimenter's expectancy can influence one's results. One of the many important things that Dr. Schmeidler did in her second term as PA president, was to bring Dr. Rosenthal to the annual convention, and he gave, what to me, was a very important talk. I think that the Rosenthal effect is of utmost importance, and in parapsychology, perhaps more than in any other area in psychology, what we believe is what we get. This is going to make it very, very difficult for us to actually pin down the critical variables that are dependable and that always lead us in a certain direction. As Dr. Rhine said this morning, there are certain people who are more likely to obtain significant results in psi than other people because of their personalities, their belief systems and their nature. I think it is naive for parapsychologists to feel that they can be completely objective, that they can leave their belief systems out of the experiment, and that what they say to the subject has no impact on how the subject performs. The sooner parapsychologists realize this, the better. It will make research more complicated for us, but it's still one of the facts of life.