

# THE ROLE OF THE LIBRARY IN EDUCATION FOR PARAPSYCHOLOGY

RHEA A. WHITE

## INTRODUCTION

It is obvious that in the transmission of knowledge about parapsychology to students parapsychologists are the starting point, for initially they must provide reliable information about parapsychology to teachers who in turn will inform students. But librarians, particularly reference librarians, should also be considered as having an important role in education for parapsychology, for they serve as middlemen between the parapsychologists, on the one hand, and the teachers and students, on the other.

Although some who will teach parapsychology have learned about the subject firsthand through visits to research centers and perhaps even from actual experimentation, most teachers will get their information from secondary sources. And although teaching courses and workshops may be held, or films and tapes on teaching parapsychology prepared, the most important medium will still be the written word. The chief repositories of our knowledge about parapsychology are now, and I think will remain, journals and books. These will serve as the basis for what is taught on parapsychology. And although, hopefully, teachers will encourage their students to do research, conduct field trips to local laboratories or other places of parapsychological interest, and provide thorough and reliable lecture notes, students will doubtless also be asked to do reading on parapsychology outside the classroom. In addition there will be many independent learners who are not enrolled in courses but who will be seeking to educate themselves on parapsychology. So from the point of view of both teachers and students, the librarian will be called on to play an active role.

But how is the teacher, let alone the student, going to know which books of the hundreds of titles available provide reliable information? Where will they find out what the important journals are, and having

found out, how will they know what specific subjects are covered, and in which issues? And if they get *that* far, how will they get hold of a copy of the book or article they need? Although in the past a handful of parapsychologists and parapsychological organizations have borne the brunt of this educational burden, the demand today has gone far beyond their means to answer it. But the answers to these questions may be found at the library, although not necessarily by the teacher or student looking for information solely on his own.

Most people assume that the key to the resources of any library is its card catalog, and if they don't find what they are looking for under the first heading they try in the catalog, they give up. But the catalog is a very imperfect index and if a patron cannot find what he needs on his own, he should never leave the library without first consulting a reference librarian. Even if he does find some information himself, it is likely that a librarian can help him find additional, and perhaps better, material.

A reference librarian is someone who is professionally trained to help people find the information they seek. If the information exists anywhere, theoretically a reference librarian can find it. In actual practice, of course, there are limitations such as time, language barriers, and possibly financial considerations. For example, if the only source of an answer is a book in a library in the Soviet Union which is for reference use only, and the patron needs it the next day, obviously a librarian cannot get it for him. But for materials in English, given enough time, a good reference librarian should be able to answer nine out of every ten questions put to him.

Upon being consulted, a librarian may first go to the card catalog even though the patron protests he has already tried it. This is because the patron may not have looked under the right subject heading, and if not, the library could contain many books of interest to him but he would not know it. A good catalog would contain cross references from all synonymous headings to the one actually used, but catalogers are human and do not always include all relevant terms. So a librarian who is familiar with the use of the catalog and aware of its imperfections can often find books listed there, after some perseverance, which the patron was not able to locate for himself.

But even when used properly, the card catalog is only one means of finding information in a library. The reference librarian is aware of many other approaches to information and is being paid to help people find what they are looking for.

As I see it, the librarian has two functions to perform which are central to education for parapsychology. First, even if he knows little about parapsychology, by using specialized sources he can help the

student and teacher find the information they need. In my daily work as a reference librarian I am frequently confronted by patrons who say something like, "I don't suppose you know anything about marketing procedures, but do you think you could help me find information on automation in marketing"? Or, "do you know anything about organic chem? I need a particular formula." And I reply, "No, I don't know anything about marketing—or organic chemistry—but that doesn't matter. I know where we can find the answers." With the proper reference tools, librarians can help people find the information they need, including information on parapsychology.

You will note I just referred to reference "tools." I will be using the term throughout this paper. By "tool" librarians refer not to hammers or saws but primarily to books: not just to any kind of book, but to a particular class of books which tells where to find information on a particular subject. Such books are truly the tools of the librarian's trade, and when he has the proper tools, he can help people find information on parapsychology or any other subject *even though he personally knows nothing at all about it*. This is important, and so is being emphasized, because although we as parapsychologists must provide teachers of parapsychology with the knowledge of what to teach, we must provide librarians with the proper tools. Much of the remainder of this paper will be devoted to describing and evaluating existing reference tools and pointing out what additional tools are needed.

The second function which librarians can perform on behalf of teachers and students (and for that matter, parapsychologists) is that of obtaining copies of specific books, periodical articles, films, technical reports, or whatever else is needed. Here the question is not what book or magazine will answer the patron's needs. Rather, what he wants has been determined and the problem is to find a copy. Sometimes the needed item is in the library but the patron doesn't realize it; or else he knows it, but still can't find it. More often, especially as regards parapsychological materials, the item will not be owned by the library, but library service today is not confined to the walls of one's own library. Any librarian worth his salt can obtain 90% of what has been published for his patron and in regard to nine percent of the remaining ten, at least tell the patron where actual copies may be found even if, for whatever reason, the library cannot get a copy.

The process of obtaining a book from another library is called "interlibrary loan," or "interloan," for short. Periodical articles also may be obtained in this way. (However, in the case of an article, usually a photocopy of the original is obtained, rather than the periodical itself. This service is usually free, but occasionally a nominal fee is charged, especially for articles longer than 20 pages.)

Since at the present time the most important sources of parapsychological information, the periodicals of the field, are not owned by many libraries, as the volume of parapsychological research increases so will the demand for interloaned articles from these journals. This points up another reason why it behooves parapsychologists to see that the proper reference tools in their field are produced. When interloaning a book or periodical article for a patron, a librarian simply cannot take the patron's word that the author and title are correct as he has given them. Moreover, the publisher and date of the publication are required, and rarely does the patron have this information available. Even if he has it written down somewhere, invariably he leaves it—and for that matter his library card—at home when he comes to the library! In interloaning a periodical article, not only the author and title are required, but also the name of the journal, the volume, the year, and the inclusive pagination.

So before interloaning an item, a librarian must "verify," as it is called in the trade, the bibliographic information on the book or article the patron wants. (A librarian spends a good many hours each week verifying interloans, some searches taking close to an hour or even more.) Books are checked against *Books in Print*, *Cumulative Book Index*, the *Library of Congress Catalog of Books*, and other general reference tools. Books on parapsychology may be checked in these same works just as books in any other field, so they are not a special problem. But articles in parapsychological journals are. The only indexing and abstracting service that presently includes significant runs of parapsychological periodicals is *Psychological Abstracts*, and one problem is that only large libraries are likely to own it. Second, even if a library owns it, it may not own a complete run. And third, the *Journal of Parapsychology* is the only parapsychological periodical with complete coverage in *Psych. Abstracts*. There is only scattered coverage of the SPR, ASPR, and Parapsychology Foundation publications, and inclusion of even one issue of a foreign language parapsychology periodical is a rarity. On the surface this may seem a small matter, but I assure you its ramifications are far-reaching. This is a weak link in parapsychology's chain of information and it will certainly slow down the educational process if it is not soon strengthened.

The remainder of this paper will be devoted to descriptions of some general sources of parapsychological information, some specifically parapsychological information sources, as well as some areas of parapsychology lacking bibliographic control and some specific reference tools which are needed in parapsychology.

GENERAL REFERENCE TOOLS CONTAINING  
PARAPSYCHOLOGICAL INFORMATION

There are a number of general reference tools which provide information on parapsychology and are to be found in most libraries of any appreciable size. The first tool, of course, is the card catalog, as has been mentioned. This may be used not only to locate books under the name of the author or title but also by subject. In order to use the card catalog productively, one must know the right subject headings under which to look. Most libraries use Library of Congress subject headings, or modifications of them. The subject headings of primary relevance to parapsychology are as follows: APPARITIONS, ASTRAL PROJECTION (for out-of-the-body experiences), CLAIRVOYANCE, DIVINATION, EXTRASENSORY PERCEPTION, FAITH-CURE (for unorthodox healing), FUTURE LIFE (for survival), GHOSTS, OCCULT SCIENCES, PSYCHICAL RESEARCH (for parapsychology), SECOND SIGHT (for precognition), SPIRITUALISM (for mediumship), and THOUGHT TRANSFERENCE (for Telepathy).

Having exhausted the library's store of books on parapsychology, one may look for additional titles in the *Subject Guide to Books in Print* which also uses Library of Congress subject headings. The books listed in this annual publication are taken from U.S. publishers' catalogs of in-print books. A more exhaustive listing, by author, title, or subject, may be found in the *Cumulative Book Index*, which attempts to list all books published in the English language. If a paperback book on parapsychology is wanted, *Paperbound Books in Print* may be consulted. It is published twice a year and lists books on parapsychology under the heading PSYCHOLOGY—OCCULT SCIENCES AND PARAPSYCHOLOGY. New books that have been published since the annual *Books in Print* are included both in a supplement to *Books in Print* which is published between editions, and *Forthcoming Books*, which includes newly published titles as well as books about to be published. Parapsychology books are listed again under the heading, PSYCHOLOGY—OCCULT SCIENCES AND PARAPSYCHOLOGY.

If biographical information on persons associated with parapsychology is needed, *Biography Index* is a useful guide to material in whole books, parts of books, reference sources, and magazines. It uses the unfortunate heading of PSYCHISTS for both parapsychologists and psychics.

The names and addresses of parapsychological organizations as well as brief descriptive information about them may be found in Gale's

*Encyclopedia of Associations* and its supplement, *New Associations*. Reviews of books on parapsychology other than those published in parapsychological journals may be located through *Book Review Index* and *Book Review Digest* and to a lesser extent, *Index to Book Reviews in the Humanities*. For general magazine articles on parapsychology, *Reader's Guide to Periodical Literature* is invaluable. The relevant subject headings in *Reader's Guide* are CLAIRVOYANCE, EXTRASENSORY PERCEPTION, FAITH CURE, FUTURE LIFE, GHOSTS, MEDIUMS, OCCULT SCIENCES, PARAPSYCHOLOGY, PRECOGNITION, PSYCHOKINESIS, SPIRITUALISM, AND TELEPATHY. More specialized articles may be found through *Psychological Abstracts* under the headings of CLAIRVOYANCE, EXTRASENSORY PERCEPTION, PARAPSYCHOLOGICAL PHENOMENA, PARAPSYCHOLOGY, PRECOGNITION, PSYCHOKINESIS, AND TELEPATHY. The *Social Sciences and Humanities Index* and the new *Social Sciences Index* (which includes the *Journal of the American Society for Psychical Research* and *Journal of Parapsychology*) are also useful and generally use the same subject headings as *Reader's Guide*.

Definitions of terms may be found in the unabridged dictionaries and in psychological and psychiatric dictionaries, especially those by Drever, English and English, Eysenck, and Warren.

A number of general encyclopedias, as well as specialized ones such as the *McGraw-Hill Encyclopedia of Science and Technology*, the *Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, and the *International Encyclopedia of the Social Sciences*, contain considerable information on parapsychology. The contents of these encyclopedias as regards parapsychology are reviewed and evaluated in *Parapsychology: Sources of Information*.<sup>35</sup>

These are just a few of the general reference tools which a large percentage of libraries are likely to own and which provide basic information on parapsychology. They are especially helpful in libraries which do not carry many specifically parapsychological tools. Any reference librarian will know about all these sources and of course many more.

#### SPECIFIC REFERENCE SOURCES IN PARAPSYCHOLOGY

When I was invited to this conference, I was asked to describe a basic reference collection in parapsychology. Accordingly, in this section I will review the reference books that exist in the field, but will conclude the paper with a more extensive list of what we do not have.

There are two major kinds of reference works in any field: those that are in themselves compendiums of information, such as handbooks, almanacs, encyclopedias, dictionaries, yearbooks, atlases, and so forth;

and those consisting of works whose purpose is to provide bibliographic control, or listings of existing sources of information in a particular subject, so that access may be gained to any part of it. In other words, this type of tool will tell you what is available and where to find it, but unlike the first type, it does not contain the actual information. In a sense, the second type is more important than the first, for without access to the complete file of information on a given subject, the first type of reference work could not be compiled. I will therefore begin with a description of our bibliographic reference works.

#### *Bibliographic Tools in Parapsychology*

A major means of obtaining bibliographic control of the books in a given field is through catalogs of the collections of large libraries specializing in that subject. This type of tool serves the dual purpose of providing bibliographic information on what has been published, as well as indicating what library owns a copy. Our field already has several library catalogs. One of the first was Harry Price's *Short-Title Catalogue of Works on Psychical Research, Spiritualism, Magic, Psychology, Legerdemain and Other Methods of Deception, Charlatanism, Witchcraft and Technical Works for the Scientific Investigation of Alleged Abnormal Phenomena from circa 1450 A.D. to 1929 A.D.*<sup>17</sup> (It may be a "short title catalogue," but for a catalog, it certainly has a long title!) It lists 6000 titles. Price also compiled a supplement<sup>18</sup> to his catalog containing 2500 additional items acquired between 1929 and 1934. The College of Psychic Studies, when known as the London Spiritualist Alliance, published a title and author catalog<sup>11</sup> of their library in 1931 which was updated by supplements in 1939 and 1950. The published catalog of a smaller collection is the *Catalogue of the John William Graham Collection of the Literature of Psychic Sciences*, published in 1950.<sup>30</sup>

Unfortunately none of the above catalogs contains information on books published since 1950, yet for the most part the more recent books are also the more important ones. This situation is soon to be rectified for G. K. Hall has announced the publication, next year, of the *Catalogue of the Library of the Society for Psychical Research*. It will contain listings by both author and title.\*

A second type of bibliography is the standard subject bibliography which lists titles on a given subject by author, or under a number of subsidiary subject headings, or both. This is one of the most important

---

\* This has now been published. It may be obtained from G. K. Hall & Co., 70 Lincoln Street, Boston, Mass. 02111.

types of reference tool for parapsychology, since it is essential to obtaining the requisite background information on any aspect of the field, but unfortunately we do not have adequate coverage.

Zorab's *Bibliography of Parapsychology*<sup>38</sup> is notable for two reasons: it is a subject bibliography which includes both books and periodical articles and it lists works in several languages. Unfortunately it is highly selective, and even with the supplement which was published in 1960, it is now outdated.

Probably the most important bibliographic attempt we have in parapsychology is Techter's *Bibliography and Index of Psychic Research and Related Topics*<sup>32</sup> which was published for the years 1962, 1963, and 1964. It consisted of an author list of practically everything published on parapsychology for each of those three years, with a subject approach through an index. Had funds been available to continue its publication, many of our current bibliographic problems would be much less acute.

The Naumov and Vilenskaya *Bibliographies on Parapsychology*,<sup>13</sup> which was translated into English and published by the Joint Publications Research Service, provides a selective listing of publications on parapsychology in all languages, with emphasis on Russian materials (with English titles).

Some useful bibliographies, which are important because they emphasize periodical articles and cover recent material, are compiled by Mrs. Babusis, the librarian of the Eileen J. Garrett Library of the Parapsychology Foundation. These bibliographies vary in length from 4 to 8 pages, and each is devoted to a specific subject, for example, unorthodox healing, out-of-the-body experiences, and auras. Unfortunately these bibliographies are not published, but photocopies are available upon request.

Two bibliographic guides to the literature of parapsychology, both of which appeared in 1973, are Ashby's *Guidebook for the Study of Psychical Research*<sup>1</sup> and *Parapsychology: Sources of Information*, by Laura Dale and myself.<sup>35</sup> Although there is considerable overlap in titles, they by no means cover the same books. Annotations are included in both, although Ashby only annotated a portion of his titles. His bibliography is in two main sections: books for the beginning student and books for the advanced student. The arrangement of White and Dale is by subject, but each title is rated according to whether it is suitable for a beginner, an intermediate student, or an advanced reader. Book review citations are provided for each title.

Finally, although not intended primarily as bibliographies, *Extrasensory Perception after Sixty Years* compiled by J. B. Rhine and others<sup>22</sup> and



Rao's *Experimental Parapsychology*<sup>19</sup> include extensive bibliographies (361 items in the former and 1251 in the latter) and are especially important because most of the references are to articles in parapsychological periodicals.

### Indexes

My definition of an index is a tool that enables you to do in seconds what otherwise would have taken hours or even days. In fact, a good index can make it possible for one to do what otherwise one might not even attempt. And yet, even though indexes are probably the most useful reference tool of all, we have virtually none in parapsychology. The Society for Psychical Research has published an index to its *Journal* and *Proceedings*<sup>23-26</sup> which is in four parts. This is useful in narrowing down a search, but unfortunately the index does not tell you the author or title of the article you are being directed to, and so after troubling to find it, you may learn you already have that reference! The last issue<sup>7</sup> of the *Proceedings of the Parapsychological Association* (before it became *Research in Parapsychology*) has a useful cumulative index. Most parapsychological periodicals have their own indexes for each volume, but when a title such as the *Journal of the American Society for Psychical Research* has been published since 1907, it means that 68 separate indexes must be consulted.

Lacking a cumulative index, it is quite useful at least to be able to scan a table of contents listing. Here again the SPR is a pioneer, having compiled lists of the major contents of both its *Proceedings*<sup>28</sup> and *Journal*.<sup>27</sup> My September, 1953, issue of the *Journal of Parapsychology* is very dogeared and worn, because it contained a contents listing of the JP<sup>31</sup> from 1937 through June, 1953. But it only covered 17 volumes of the 38 that now exist. Surely it is time for a new *Journal of Parapsychology* table of contents listing! An index to the ASPR publications was compiled by Fraser Nicol, but it is at least ten years behind the current volume, and only exists in the form of a card file in the ASPR library.

An attempt at indexing in detail the contents of books of importance in parapsychology was made with *Parapsychology: Sources of Information*.<sup>35</sup> Each of the 282 books included is not only classified by subject but the index of subjects at the back of the book contains several index terms per book. For example, the Ciba Foundation Symposium, *Extrasensory Perception*, which is classified under Interdisciplinary Works, contains a few papers on anpsi, and this is indicated in the finer subject index. It also includes the first index we have to illustrations, but it is limited to those found in the 282 books, the encyclopedias, and

the periodicals described in the book. This is only a fraction of the illustrative material which exists, and which is in demand for use in teaching, in displays, and in audio-visual materials.

#### *Abstracts*

As has been pointed out, *Psychological Abstracts* provides some coverage of parapsychological periodicals, especially the *Journal of Parapsychology*. Gaining access to these abstracts, however, is not easy, because the indexing of *Psych. Abstracts* is poor.

"Parapsychological Abstracts," a section of the *Journal of Parapsychology* since 1958, contains useful summaries of articles in other parapsychological journals, of articles on parapsychology in non-parapsychological journals, of books which otherwise would not be reviewed in JP, and of some foreign articles or books as well. An author and title listing of each abstract is included in the annual table of contents listing of JP, and the abstracts are included in the annual JP subject index.

#### *Specialized Encyclopedias*

For older material we have Spence's *Encyclopedia of Occultism*<sup>29</sup> which, however, does not contain much material of direct relevance to parapsychology. Fodor's *Encyclopedia of Psychic Science*<sup>8</sup> covers terms, publications, events, and persons associated with psychical research and spiritualism. However, because it was published in 1933, it necessarily contains nothing on modern experimental parapsychology, which was then just beginning. A more up-to-date encyclopedia is the 24-volume *Man, Myth and Magic* edited by Cavendish.<sup>6</sup> It is lavishly illustrated and covers parapsychology along with magic, witchcraft and occultism. Cavendish has recently edited another encyclopedia, independent of the first, which is entitled the *Encyclopedia of the Unexplained*.<sup>5</sup> It is a one-volume work and is quite useful as a reference. Rhine served as an advisor for it on parapsychological material and wrote some of the entries himself. Long articles are signed and contain references to further information.

#### *Terminology*

If definitions of terms are needed, older terms associated with spiritualism and early psychical research may be found in Fodor<sup>8</sup> and Spence.<sup>29</sup> Some of the terms associated with experimental parapsychology may be found in the Cavendish encyclopedias as well as in glossaries which have appeared in recent books such as Ashby,<sup>1</sup>

Mitchell et al.<sup>12</sup> and White and Dale.<sup>35</sup> The best glossary we have for research-oriented terms is the one published in each issue of the *Journal of Parapsychology*. An even more inclusive glossary including both older terms and experimental terms will appear in Wolman's *Handbook of Parapsychology*.<sup>37</sup>

#### Directories

A directory is a listing of organizations, persons, or publications associated with a particular field or other subject area. Although parapsychology is still small enough so that everyone in it knows almost everyone else, as well as the major organizations in the field, even we could use a directory to serve as a handy source of addresses! And of course the first thing needed by a newcomer to the field would be a directory.

Most of the directory-type information we have is very scattered. The leader in providing this sort of information is the Parapsychology Foundation. From time to time the *Newsletter of the Parapsychology Foundation* and now *Parapsychology Review* contains an "International Directory of Parapsychological Associations,"<sup>9</sup> the latest one having been published this year. It is arranged geographically and lists the name and address of each organization and the name of the person to contact.

Another useful directory published in *Parapsychology Review* is "A Selected List of Periodicals in Parapsychology and Related Subjects, Currently in Print, and Received by the Eileen J. Garrett Library."<sup>12</sup> It is also arranged geographically, and gives the title, publisher, editor, price, and a brief description of 53 periodicals.

A description of the major parapsychological research organizations and English-language periodicals is given in *Parapsychology: Sources of Information*<sup>35</sup> and Ashby's *Guidebook*<sup>1</sup> includes descriptions of research organizations, libraries, periodicals, and bookshops. Directory-type information on organizations, publications, lectures, and libraries is included in Chapter 8 of Mitchell, et al.<sup>12</sup>

An annual directory entitled "Courses and Other Study Opportunities in Parapsychology"<sup>14</sup> compiled by Marian Nester is published each year by the Education Department, American Society for Psychical Research. Each issue is usually updated by a supplement. It is a non-evaluative list of credit and non-credit college courses. For each college or university included it provides information on the department giving the course, the instructor's name, the name of the course, requirements for taking it, if any, and the name of the person to contact for details.

The best current source of directory information is *Parapsychology Review*. Also useful is the *ASPR Newsletter*, the "News" section of the *Journal of Parapsychology*, and the "News Ambit" section of *Psychic*.

However, there is a wealth of information that never gets published, due to lack of space and the ephemeral nature of much of this material, which nonetheless, for the moment at least, has considerable importance. A new organization has been formed in New York for the express purpose of disseminating reliable information. It is called Information Services for Psi Education, or ISPE. Its purpose is to serve as a clearinghouse for parapsychology and related information. It hopes to make available, particularly through its publication, *Psi News*, information on sources and resources in parapsychology. It is specifically aimed at educators, but will assist anyone interested in information on organizations, services, products, publications, and events in parapsychology. For further information, write to ISPE, Box 2221, New York 10001.

#### *Audio-Visual Materials*

Although an increasing number of movies, tapes, and slides on parapsychological subjects are becoming available, there is no master list of them, nor is there any easy way of compiling one. However, the ASPR Education Department has an unpublished list of films as well as a list of educational materials, which includes sources to contact as well as a highly selected list of tapes, a filmstrip, and a slide collection. Additional tapes of parapsychological interest may be found in the Spiritual Frontiers Fellowship's list of tape recordings for loan to members and the catalog of Big Sur Recordings.<sup>3</sup>

In the space that remains I would like to describe some types of information and specific reference tools which parapsychology lacks.

### AREAS IN WHICH BIBLIOGRAPHIC CONTROL IS LACKING

#### *Experimental Data*

It seems to me that parapsychology more than most fields needs to preserve the data on which its reports are based, whether it be transcripts of mediumistic trances or token object readings or dream protocols or experimental studies of ESP and PK using cards and dice. This is needed in part because of the many criticisms of our claims. Presumably we have nothing to hide from our critics and the sooner they realize this, the better off we'll all be.

But critics are not the only ones interested in examining the data on which published reports are based. Many psi effects have been

discovered in later investigations which were then noted also in the data of earlier experiments when they were reanalyzed in the light of the new findings. Displacement is a notable example. There is always the possibility that as we become more sophisticated in recognizing the presence of psi, later analyses may turn up evidence of it even in what are now considered to be chance results.

Fortunately, in the past most of the experimental work was done in one laboratory—the Duke University Parapsychology Laboratory—and so the data were readily accessible for reanalysis. However, with the spread of parapsychological research to many other centers in recent years, maintaining control of data becomes a problem. It would be helpful if, after an investigator has finished with his data, he could voluntarily place them on file in a central data archives where the material would be preserved, cataloged, and made available to anyone wanting to review it, with the investigator's permission.

Moreover, the question is frequently raised in the literature as to what percentage of parapsychological experiments never get published because insignificant results were obtained. It would be to the credit of parapsychology if data and reports of unpublished experiments, if available, were also kept on file.

#### *Technical Reports*

Occasionally an experimental report or paper on parapsychology is published separately, i.e., not in book or periodical form: for example, "Testing for Extrasensory Perception with a Machine," by W. R. Smith, E. F. Dagle, and others, which was published by the Air Force; or the Parapsychological Association's "Techniques and Status of Modern Parapsychology," the transcript of the first PA American Association for the Advancement of Science symposium; or the Myers Memorial Lectures, which are published by the SPR but not generally as part of their *Proceedings* or *Journal*. Some of these independent papers are quite important and certainly may one day be of historical interest, but they tend to get lost after a period of time because they do not lend themselves to storage in a particular file nor are they likely to be indexed. Parapsychological libraries, at least, should pay particular attention to the cataloging and storage of these elusive items.

#### *Foreign Language Materials*

Another area in which bibliographic control, in this country at least, is almost entirely lacking is that of materials published in languages other than English. We do not have a record of what has been published, either in the form of books or periodicals, nor a subject or

author approach to this material. Perhaps the European Parapsychological Association can do something to rectify this situation, at least for the languages represented among its members.

#### *Translations*

For those who can only read English it would be helpful to have English translations of at least the titles of all the foreign language material. Then those that are of particular interest could be selected for translation. We also need a listing of translations already in existence. At present there is no record of what has been translated nor where it exists. Many of these translations are not published. The ASPR library, for example, has several unpublished translations on file.

### SPECIFIC TYPES OF REFERENCE TOOLS NEEDED

In addition to the need to control certain types of material in parapsychology, there are several specific tools which the field requires.

#### *Handbook or Manual*

The fields of chemistry and physics have many handbooks which contain tables and formulae and other such tabular information. Parapsychology's needs in this area are different due to the nature of our subject matter, but we could use something like the *Psychology Almanac* recently compiled by Wilkening.<sup>36</sup> It contains the APA's "ethical standards for psychologists," descriptions of journals in psychology and related fields, terminology, some symbols and notations used in statistics, and 34 statistical tables. It seems to me that the Parapsychological Association ought to sponsor the publication of something similar which would contain information on the P.A., basic ESP and PK tests, including methods of obtaining targets in precognition tests, special test booklets such as those developed by Freeman, and psychological tests used in parapsychology experiments such as the Betts Imagery Scale, the Knapp attitude toward time questionnaire, the Taylor Manifest Anxiety Scale, Stuart's interest inventory, and the "mood" questions used by Nielsen and Osis, to name a few which come quickly to mind. There are many others of course. It would also bring together descriptions of all the analyses used for evaluating various psi effects such as the reinforcement effect, salience ratios, variance, etc. I think that such a tool would be of immense practical importance to students and to researchers and in itself would

be a stimulus to carry out research. It would not only save time in planning research but it would encourage more sophisticated designs and it would aid in standardizing research methodology. (A handbook of such tests in psychology has recently been compiled by Lake et al. called *Measuring Human Behavior*.)<sup>10</sup>

#### *Union List of Parapsychological Periodicals*

A "union list of periodicals" is a listing of the periodical holdings in a group of libraries. It would be very useful to know what specific libraries have which issues of what parapsychological journals. For example, in an index I am preparing, I would like to include all issues of the *Newsletter of the Parapsychology Foundation*, but neither the ASPR Library, FRNM Library, or even the Eileen J. Garrett Library has certain issues. Does anybody? A union list would tell us. Such a list should include all parapsychological journals that have been published in any language and it should include listings for large public, college, and university libraries, parapsychological libraries, and perhaps even some individual libraries. The *Union List of Serials* and its supplement, *New Serial Titles*, put out by the Library of Congress, already supply this information for a number of large libraries in the United States and Canada. I am simply proposing that to its listings we add the holdings of parapsychological libraries the world over.

#### *Biographical Dictionary*

Although the Parapsychology Foundation's pioneer *Biographical Dictionary of Parapsychology*<sup>4</sup> was an excellent first step in providing a source of biographical information on persons associated with parapsychology, it is time for a new edition. For example, only a third of the current members of the Parapsychological Association are in the *Biographical Dictionary*. Ashby's *Guidebook*<sup>1</sup> is much more recent and has a biographical section, but it only includes one person not in the *Biographical Dictionary* (John Beloff, I am happy to say, has this honor), but the entries of the *Biographical Dictionary* are much more complete than those in Ashby.

#### *Union Catalog of Books on Parapsychology*

In many fields, a means of providing increased bibliographic control is the compilation of a "union catalog." A union catalog is a listing of the combined book holdings of a number of libraries in a particular geographic location or a specific subject area. For example, the library where I work is located in Nassau County, New York. There are 53

libraries in the county. The Nassau Library System maintains a union catalog of the books in all the libraries in the county so that if we do not own a book or our copy is out, we may find out from Nassau Library System what other libraries own the book, and borrow it from them for our patron.

A useful means of obtaining bibliographic control of the books in our field would be to compile a union catalog of the books in the major parapsychological libraries. This would not only tell us what has been published but where copies may be found.

#### *Encyclopedic Compendium*

Another reference tool we lack is an authoritative encyclopedia which includes information on experimental parapsychology and other developments since 1930, as well as the older material covered in Fodor<sup>8</sup> and Spence.<sup>29</sup> The multi-volume Cavendish set<sup>6</sup> and the one-volume *Encyclopedia of the Unexplained*<sup>5</sup> are useful, but much more coverage is given in them to the occult, magic, and witchcraft than to hardcore parapsychology. We need a work which deals extensively with psi missing, position effects, dual targets, the psychic shuffle, experimenter effects in parapsychology, doctrinal compliance, the "psychic pathology of everyday life," and so forth.

However, perhaps what we need at this stage more than an encyclopedia is a compendium of review articles on where we stand, what we know, how we know it, and what we need to find out, in all the major areas of parapsychology. I mean review articles aimed at parapsychologists, rather than surveys directed at laymen or specialists in other fields. It would be the sort of article psychologists write for other psychologists in *Psychological Bulletin*. We have some papers that would qualify in this category, such as the two-part review of the sheep-goat work done by Palmer,<sup>15, 16</sup> or Rhine's reviews of psi missing<sup>21</sup> and position effects,<sup>20</sup> or Ullman's review of psi and psychiatry in a recent psychiatric textbook.<sup>33</sup> I have recently brought together for publication 19 of these review articles and have updated their bibliographies, but in compiling this work<sup>34</sup> I became acutely aware of the many subjects for which we do not have state-of-the-art reviews. I think we need this sort of job done not only for students and teachers and librarians but for parapsychologists themselves. I am hopeful that Wolman's *Handbook of Parapsychology*<sup>37</sup> will serve this purpose, but it is too soon to tell.

#### *Periodical Index*

Finally, I would like to conclude this list of the types of reference



tools we need with what I think is the most important one of all: a detailed index to the periodical literature. This is what we need more than anything else in order for students to be able to locate the work that has been done relevant to their own interests and also so that we ourselves do not spend more hours than necessary of precious time in reviewing the literature. But what is a student, or for that matter, a research worker, to do who wants to review research on, say, the decline effect? We have no review articles on the decline effect. He could check the annual indexes of the *Journal of Parapsychology* and the *Journal of the ASPR* and the four indexes to the SPR publications—if he had access to them, and that is very unlikely. But say he did, then would he still have enough time? Done properly, it would take literally days. What is needed is a detailed index to periodical articles so that all one need do is look under “decline effect” and find references to all the articles that have anything significant to say about the decline effect. Sometimes I think we forget that most people in the field grew up with knowledge of the decline effect, the question of whether ESP is diametric, the fact that multiple tasks invite the preferential effect, and so forth. This information was absorbed by osmosis as we went along. But in the expanding world of parapsychology today, we have reached a new stage where a more formal and standardized approach to information is needed. There is no virtue I can see in having to spend hours or days on a search that could just as easily be accomplished in minutes. Time enough will be spent in getting hold of the material and in actually reading it.

The only alternative, and it is increasingly evident from reference lists at the end of articles that this is the road we are being forced to take, is to be concerned mainly with what has been done in approximately the past ten years, and not attempt to pay attention to what was done earlier, except for what spontaneously comes to mind or is encountered by serendipity. This too is foolish. The *Journal of Parapsychology*, for example, is a goldmine of information and has been since the very first issue. But at the present time only those may make full use of it who possess complete runs *and* have the time to search it anew with every question that arises.

Unless, of course, one had an index.

I am happy to say that, with the assistance of the Parapsychology Foundation, I am at work on two such indexes, one to articles on parapsychology in English in non-parapsychological journals and one to the major English-language parapsychological periodicals. The first will cover general periodicals such as *Atlantic*, *Life*, *McCall's*, *Science*, *Time* and specialized journals such as *American Anthropologist*, *English Journal*, *Physics Today*, and *Psychological Bulletin*. The second one will

cover the 13 parapsychological periodicals described in *Parapsychology: Sources of Information*.<sup>35</sup> However, I am not equipped to do the same job for periodicals in languages other than English. I hope the European Parapsychological Association or some other organization or individual will see the value of such an index to periodicals in other languages and will undertake to compile one.

#### CONCLUDING REMARKS

Some may consider this discussion of the role of the librarian and the use of reference tools far removed from the core of parapsychology which is research. Others may feel that having to consult a reference librarian or to turn to reference works is not for parapsychologists themselves but only for those who know little about the subject. Throughout this paper I have tried to show that both of these ideas are incorrect. For one thing, in a field as small as ours, with so few workers actively engaged in research, it is as if each person must do the work of three. What we lack, among other things, is man hours. And I want to stress that what adequate reference tools and professional library service can provide us with is *time*. And second, no matter what the field, whether it be parapsychology, physics, or philosophy, the aim is *completeness*—to leave no stone unturned in the quest of extending man's knowledge. No man can remember everything in his field, let alone be exposed to all of it to begin with. But a good index can quickly provide him with the information he would have had if he had read everything and had a photographic memory of every detail. A competent bibliography or directory or handbook can save many precious hours and insure completeness of coverage as well. This is true both for literature searches required by those engaged in research and those involved with the process of teaching parapsychology or learning about it. Everyone in parapsychology is called on from time to time to provide information of an educational nature—a list of publications, certain names and addresses, a bit of historical information, or a survey of a certain type of experiment. I wish I had back the many, many hours I have spent looking for a name or an address or a bit of information I knew existed but not exactly where. Or, even if I knew something had been published in a particular publication, say the *Parapsychology Bulletin*, I still would have to look through each issue until I found it. If I had an index, I not only could find it quickly, but I would probably also find references to related information with which my memory alone would not provide me.

So I would like to close by urging all parapsychologists to do whatever they can to see that our field gets the proper reference tools it

needs. We would probably get where we are going without them, but with them, it will be a lot faster. In the same way, those of us who did not have to cross an ocean to get here could have walked to San Francisco. But it certainly saved a lot of time and shoe leather to be able to fly!

## REFERENCES

- <sup>1</sup> Ashby, R. *The Guidebook for the Study of Psychical Research* (N. Y., Samuel Weiser, 1972).
- <sup>2</sup> Babusis, G. "A selected List of Periodicals in Parapsychology & Related Subjects, Currently in Print, & Received by the Eileen J. Garrett Library," *Parapsychology Review*, 1974, 5(5), 23-27.
- <sup>3</sup> Big Sur Recordings (2015 Bridgeway—Dept. T, Sausalito, Cal. 94965).
- <sup>4</sup> *Biographical Dictionary of Parapsychology with Directory and Glossary: 1964-1966*. Edited by H. Pleasants (N. Y., Garrett/Helix, 1964).
- <sup>5</sup> Cavendish, R. (Ed.). *Encyclopedia of the Unexplained: Magic, Occultism and Parapsychology* (N. Y., McGraw-Hill, 1974).
- <sup>6</sup> Cavendish, R. (Ed.). *Man, Myth & Magic; an Illustrated Encyclopedia of the Supernatural* (N. Y., Marshall Cavendish, 1970). 24 vols.
- <sup>7</sup> Cumulative index to Numbers 1-8 (1957-1971). *Proceedings of the Parapsychological Association*, 1971, No. 8, 161-206.
- <sup>8</sup> "Directory of Parapsychological Associations." *Parapsychology Review*, 1975, 6(1), 22-28.
- <sup>9</sup> Fodor, N. *Encyclopaedia of Psychic Science* (Secaucus, N. J., University Books, 1966). (First published in 1933).
- <sup>10</sup> Lake, D. G., Miles, M. B., and Earle, R. B., Jr., (Eds.). *Measuring Human Behavior: Tools for the Assessment of Social Functioning* (N. Y., Teachers College Press, 1973).
- <sup>11</sup> London Spiritualist Alliance. *Catalogue of the Library of the London Spiritualist Alliance* (London, The Alliance, 1931).
- <sup>12</sup> Mitchell, E. D., and others. Edited by J. White. *Psychic Exploration* (N. Y., Putnam's, 1974).
- <sup>13</sup> Naumov, E. K., and Vilenskaya, L. V. *Bibliographies on Parapsychology (Psychoenergetics) and Related Subjects* (Arlington, Va., Joint Publications Research Service, 1972).
- <sup>14</sup> [Nester, M.] *Courses and Other Study Opportunities in Parapsychology* (N. Y., American Society for Psychical Research, 1974).
- <sup>15</sup> Palmer, J. "Scoring in ESP Tests as a Function of Belief-in ESP. Part I. The Sheep-goat Effect," *Journal of the American Society for Psychical Research*, 1971, 65, 373-408.
- <sup>16</sup> Palmer, J. "Scoring in ESP Tests as a Function of Belief in ESP. Part II. Beyond the Sheep-goat Effect," *Journal of the American Society for Psychical Research*, 1972, 66, 1-26.
- <sup>17</sup> Price, H. *Short-title Catalogue of Works on Psychical Research, Spiritualism, Magic, Psychology, Legerdemain and Other Methods of Deception, Charlatanism, Witchcraft and Technical Works for the Scientific Investigation of Alleged Abnormal Phenomena from circa 1450 A.D. to 1929 A.D.* (London, National Laboratory of Psychical Research, 1929).
- <sup>18</sup> Price, H. *Supplement to Short-Title Catalogue of Works on Psychical Research, Alleged Abnormal Phenomena, Spiritualism, Magic, Witchcraft, Legerdemain, Charlatanism and Astrology from 1472 A.D. to the Present Day.* (London, University of London Council for Psychical Investigation, 1935).
- <sup>19</sup> Rao, K. R. *Experimental Parapsychology: A Review and Interpretation, with a Comprehensive Bibliography* (Springfield, Ill., Thomas, 1966).
- <sup>20</sup> Rhine, J. B. "Position Effects in Psi Test Results," *Journal of Parapsychology*, 1969, 33, 136-57. Also in White, R. A. *Surveys in Parapsychology* (Metuchen, N. J., Scarecrow Press).
- <sup>21</sup> Rhine, J. B. "Psi-missing Re-examined," *Journal of Parapsychology*, 1969, 33, 1-38. Also in White, R. A. *Surveys in Parapsychology* (Metuchen, N. J., Scarecrow Press).

<sup>22</sup> Rhine, J. B., and others. *Extrasensory Perception after Sixty Years: A Critical Appraisal of the Research into Extrasensory Perception* (Boston, Branden, 1966). (First published in 1940).

<sup>23</sup> Society for Psychical Research. *Combined Index to Phantasms of the Living, vols. I & II. The Proceedings, vols. I–XV. The Journal, vols. I–IX & The Proceedings of the American Society for Psychical Research. With Table of Contents of "The Proceedings"* (London, R. B. Johnson, 1904). [Part 1]

<sup>24</sup> Society for Psychical Research. *Combined Index to The Proceedings, vols. XVI–XXVI & The Journal, vols. X–XV. With Table of Contents of The Proceedings* (Glasgow, Maclehose, 1914). [Part 2]

<sup>25</sup> Society for Psychical Research. *Combined Index to Proceedings, vols. XXVII–XLVII, 1914–45, and Journal, vols. XVI–XXXIII, 1913–46* (London, Society for Psychical Research, n.d.). [Part 3]

<sup>26</sup> Society for Psychical Research. *Combined Index to Proceedings, vols. XLVIII–LIV, 1944–66, and Journal, vols. XXXIV–XLV, 1947–70* (London, Society for Psychical Research, 1973). [Part 4]

<sup>27</sup> Society for Psychical Research. *List of the Principal Contents of the Journal from 1949 to 1969* (Available from the Society, 1 Adam and Eve Mews, London, England W8 6UQ).

<sup>28</sup> Society for Psychical Research. *List of the Principal Contents of the Proceedings from 1882 to 1969* (Available from the Society, 1 Adam & Eve Mews, London, England W8 6UQ).

<sup>29</sup> Spence, L. *An Encyclopaedia of Occultism: A Compendium of Information on the Occult Sciences, Occult Personalities, Psychic Science, Magic, Demonology, Spiritism, Mysticism, and Metaphysics* (Secaucus, N. J., University Books, 1960). (First published in 1920).

<sup>30</sup> Swarthmore College. *Library. Catalogue of the John William Graham Collection of Literature of Psychic Science* (Swarthmore, Pa., John William Graham Fund for the Study of Psychic Science, 1950).

<sup>31</sup> Table of contents (volumes 1–16). *Journal of Parapsychology*, 1953, 17, 231–46.

<sup>32</sup> Techter, D. A. *Bibliography and Index of Psychic Research and Related Topics for the Year 1962* [Also for 1963 and 1964] (Chicago, Illinois Society for Psychic Research, 1963 [1964 and 1965]).

<sup>33</sup> Ullman, M. "Parapsychology and Psychiatry." In Freedman, A. M., Kaplan, H. I., and Sadock, B. *Modern Synopsis of Comprehensive Textbook of Psychiatry* (Baltimore, William & Wilkins, 1974).

<sup>34</sup> White, R. A. *Surveys in Parapsychology: Reviews of the Literature with Updated Bibliographies* (Metuchen, N. J., Scarecrow Press).

<sup>35</sup> White, R. A., and Dale, L. A. *Parapsychology: Sources of Information* (Metuchen, N. J., Scarecrow Press, 1973).

<sup>36</sup> Wilkening, H. E. *The Psychology Almanac* (Monterey, Cal., Brooks/Cole, 1973).

<sup>37</sup> Wolman, B. B. (Ed). *Handbook of Parapsychology* (N. Y., Van Nostrand Reinhold).

<sup>38</sup> Zorab, G. *Bibliography of Parapsychology* (N. Y., Garrett/Helix, 1957). (First supplement published in *Les Cahiers de la Tour Saint-Jacques*, No. 9, 1960.)

## DISCUSSION

KRIPPNER: I'd like to compliment Ms. White on her very excellent review of libraries, periodicals, reference problems, etc. It is something that certainly expanded my horizon to some of the opportunities and also some of the needs. The main thing that I would support is the need for some kind of archives in experimental parapsychology. During the years that I was at Maimonides, we compiled masses and masses of data which, in retrospect, I think could still be useful to people making various types of analyses. It got to the point where we simply didn't

have storage space and we had to throw away material. If somebody in the field had any sizeable basement or warehouse or better yet, filing cabinets, this is the sort of material that could be filed away.

The articles that these data appear in could be indexed and these could be microfilmed. Photocopies could be made available to people who wanted them. The notion of archives appeals to me very very much. I don't know how practical it is, but this might be something the PA could discuss at a future meeting to see if there is any way this could be started or initiated.

The type of proposal that John Palmer has been making, that many of you are aware of, involves filing away a protocol for the experimental before it actually starts. It seems to me that not only could the protocol be filed away, but maybe also the supportive data could be filed after the experiment has been published. I can see many, many advantages of an archives.

The other matter I wanted to mention is the information services for psi education that Marian Nester and her group have initiated. It is an excellent addition to the field, one especially useful for the colleges and universities now offering courses. I urge all of you who are not familiar with her newsletter and with the organization, to contact Ms. Nester some time before you leave tonight.

WHITE: I couldn't agree with you more.

BISAHA: There is a small point that bothers me, but I want to also compliment you on the fine and extensive work you've done in this area. It could be just a mid-west phenomenon but I know it bothers my students. Going into a library, doing research, and looking in the card catalogue, and if they do have a reference under parapsychology, there are very few volumes; but if you look under "Occult," you will find definitely Rao, Rhine—all these people under that particular reference. Now, the first place that any student goes, of course, is the library to get information, and I think that this is definitely misinformation. Is there anything we can do about this?

WHITE: Well, here again, it's useful to consult a librarian, because the librarian is there in part to interpret the catalogue, which is practically in another language, and it takes a lot of work to learn the ins and outs, which you never really do. The way it all came about is there's a lag in subject headings and when subject headings are changed, I believe new books by Dr. Rhine would be listed also elsewhere, but libraries require a lot of money to go back and recatalogue and change the cards and everything else, and usually they just don't do it. They start off with a new heading, and when that changes, they'll have a third heading perhaps, and this is why it's very important, even if you think you've

helped yourself and found something, it's a good idea to also ask the librarian.

MORRIS: I also want to compliment you, Rhea, on what I think is a very, very important presentation. I can't wait to get my hands on all these resource materials that haven't quite yet been completed. I wonder if you would comment on how long you think it would be before the indexing that you're working on now will be completed, and if you would suggest, in your own estimation, what some of the other more important things are that should be focused on.

WHITE: You mean other than the ones that I mentioned?

MORRIS: Yes, other than the ones you mentioned.

WHITE: Well, as far as how long it's going to take me to complete the indexes, I really can't give an accurate estimate. I would think at least five years. I have a full time job and a part time job and the index has to be worked on after those are done. As far as the most important ones are concerned, I think the handbook sort of thing, where we would pull together really research methodology, all the different tests—this has been done to some extent but never really for, say, graduate students or for new research workers, or all research workers for that matter, if everything were included. I would give that high priority. For myself, I would very much like to see a union list of periodicals and I don't think it will be that difficult to compile. There aren't that many parapsychological libraries, and as far as the university and college libraries and the public libraries are concerned, that's already been done by the Library of Congress in their *Union List of Serials* which is updated by *New Serial Titles*, so we would just have to get the information on what libraries have there, and get our own.

MORRIS: So then the real problem is personnel, time, money?

MORRIS: I'd like to make two comments. Number one, just to back up what Stan said about the backlog of data at Maimonides and its usefulness. One of the kinds of studies that we would like to do is to examine the role of judges in free verbal response material. One of our intentions eventually is to try to get the original classical dream study data and do sheep/goat studies with judges and look at a variety of parameters affecting the judging art itself. We would very much like to use old data from which we could make a comparison, so that's a general statement in support of your point. Now a question to you, Rhea, concerns the origin of the rather curious filing system of the Library of Congress. In our library, right after BF 1000, we have the

journals, and then we have a batch of parapsychology books, and then hypnosis, and then another batch of parapsychology books, and then all the dream books, and then another batch of parapsychology books, and those three totally separate clusters of parapsychology books, as near as I can tell, are completely overlapping in content. It's not survival here, and experiments here and something else there. Do you have any idea of the origin of this? It's a fascinating system.

WHITE: I'm not an expert on this classification system. We don't use it in the library where I work, but I would guess that again it's a matter of recataloguing, because I know that recently LC reclassified its schedule, and probably some books are in the old number that they used, or letters, and now they're putting them in the new one, and they haven't put them together, and they may never do it.

MORRIS: Is there any way we could have an input into that?

WHITE: They know it. This is just a constant problem in libraries—recataloguing; and they don't have the time, the money, or the staff to do it.

ROGO: I have two comments. One is on reference sources that I think should be mentioned. In the *Journal* of the SPR George Zorab does a review of continental periodicals. He also does a similar review of the European Press for the *Parapsychology Review*, and these are very valuable because they abstract a lot of Italian, French and German periodicals. Secondly, there's another need that was not mentioned which to me is very important and usually overlooked. Both the SPR in London, and the ASPR in New York have very extensive archives and to someone such as myself who is primarily interested in historical research these archives are very important. Yet there are no published lists of holdings for either the SPR or the ASPR archives. Now these archives have been set in order. In England, they have been put in order by Mostyn Gilbert who worked in the archives, and the ASPR archives were put in order by Thomas Tietze a few years ago. I think there is a real need to get someone to do "holding lists" of the materials that are in these archives, because they contain some phenomenal things. For instance, in the ASPR archives there is the entire Hyslop-Hodgson correspondence with some very valuable information which, of course, has never been published. Also, the Institut Metapsychique in France has an archive holding of extreme value which I don't think has been placed in order, much less catalogued, and this I think is one of the preeminent needs right now in the field.

WHITE: Yes, I certainly agree with you, Scott. There again it's a

matter of priorities and not enough money and not enough staff and not enough time. The ASPR library was roughly put in order by Tom Tietze, but he had a lot more work to do and it's by no means been catalogued. He just made rough headings that would stand for maybe a whole catalogue drawer, and right now I don't think the ASPR has any plans to go forward with this job at this time.

BELOFF: I'm glad that Scott Rogo mentioned George Zorab because quite recently in correspondence we were talking about bibliographies and he told me that he would very much like to compile a new bibliography that would be up to date and comprehensive. It struck me that he's an ideal man to do this sort of job, you know, speaking many languages, and having great knowledge of the field, etc., so that if anyone has any money for this sort of enterprise there is somebody who would be very well equipped to tackle it.

WHITE: That's good to know.

STANFORD: I notice you mentioned the current parapsychological journals, I believe you said that only the *Journal of Parapsychology* is abstracted completely in *Psychological Abstracts*, and I was wondering if you could throw any light on why this is the case and how, and under what conditions it could be rectified.

WHITE: Well, I think currently almost all of the English language journals are in *Psych Abstracts*. It's the old material I was referring to. I think the *ASPR Journal*, for example, has been in for the past fifteen years or so. Before that, it was in sporadically, and the *SPR Proceedings* was in early issues and hasn't been in recent ones—just the *Journal* has. I don't think *Psych Abstracts* has any program for going back and doing old material. I think they'll pick up new material just as they decided to recently abstract *Research in Parapsychology*, but I don't think their policy covers retrospective material, unfortunately.

FRANKLIN: There are two problems I want to bring up. One is the professional journal of non-parapsychologists and the other is unpublished manuscripts. Within the professional journals, I'm finding a number of allusions in articles to parapsychological matters and it's very, very difficult for the people working in the field of parapsychology to keep in contact with all of those. The one thing I'm hoping to do is maybe send Rhea and the Parapsychology Foundation Library, articles that I find that would deal with parapsychological type things. Namely, there was an article by Anninos on electromagnetic communication between nerves; it's a very, very interesting thing. *The Journal of Psychosomatic Medicine* is another journal in which I find



interesting articles. The *T.I.T. Journal of Life Sciences* also has some interesting things. I think that the traditional professional journals are going to have many allusions or many references which will be small; there won't be many major articles on parapsychology, but professional people will have comments.

Another thing which I see as a problem is unpublished manuscripts. I have many on my desk that have not been published and which probably will not be published, but which include some new ideas which I think are important to know about and again, I think it's probably worthwhile to submit those to libraries so that other people have reference to them.

WHITE: Are these in parapsychology? The unpublished manuscripts?

FRANKLIN: Yes, definitely on parapsychology.

WHITE: Because you could always send them to the *Journal of Parapsychology* because in their *Parapsychological Abstracts* they do publish an abstract and then they will make the full paper available in photocopy upon request.

HASTINGS: I would like to comment on, something at this point in the conference, and Rhea's material, I think, makes it more visible. We are not talking only about education and how to educate students, for parapsychology, but we are also talking about how we are going to create a professional field. Many people here, I think, assume that they are part of a professional field of parapsychology, but it may be that only now is the field beginning. Most of us here do not have degrees in parapsychology but in some other field. Parapsychology has developed out of our personal and professional work. What's happening now is that we see we are going to be educating for parapsychological research, teaching, administration, and bibliographic work. We're really discussing education in a broad context of how the group of professionals is going to become a professional field—a discipline with researchers and educational programs; with relations to institutions and other disciplines, and as Rhea has pointed out, with professional communication including indexes and up-to-the-minute state of the art material, handbooks, continual bibliographic development, etc.

This is an extremely important thing we are talking about here, and it is not what we have done in the past. Whether we like it or not, we are having to face a new professional situation, and what Rhea is talking about is how we can interact with each other so we can make this productive? There is no other experience in science, in my awareness, where the researchers and scholars are consciously discussing this—

well, maybe Michael Faraday did when he was talking about putting words to electricity. What Rhea White has pointed out is something that we should give conscious attention to in order to develop a coherent discipline.

VAUGHAN: I think that as parapsychology becomes more interdisciplinary, it creates a much greater bibliographic problem. How long can we rely on two or three journals to contain all the material of importance to us? Perhaps the PA could set up bibliographic committees, so that each discipline would have a representative, as Wilbur Franklin volunteered for physics, to send to a central location perhaps, or to the Foundation either copies or abstracts of articles which may be of importance to other parapsychologists. I think in the same way that it might be advisable to set up an "expert" index—who knows what—because our various fields of expertise are sometimes quite precise and unexpected. For instance, someone asks me for research on animal psi, and I tell them to see Bob Morris. For research on magic, now I know I must tell them to see Arthur Hastings. People are a very valuable bibliographic resource. Yet there's no central index for them.

WHITE: I think probably Mrs. Nester at the ASPR Education Department is making a beginning in doing that sort of thing, aren't you, Marian? Names of people to contact for specific purposes?

NESTER: I haven't done that particular thing, but I certainly am aware of the need myself. I think it's terribly important when students come in and want special references in a field and I want to say, "Write to so and so," and I think if that kind of information came to me, I could certainly include it in the pages that the education department puts out. Incidentally, if anybody wants to see these pages, the education department does have pages that cover some of these questions that all students ask, and if anybody wants to look at them, they can; but I think this is the kind of thing the education department can do, and we would be very glad to have this kind of information come in so that we can collate it and have it available for anybody that wants it.

ROGO: Just a couple of comments. About funding: I don't think it's generally known, but publishers are getting terribly interested in this type of material for publication purposes. This year I made three trips to New York during which I met with several publishers over publication policy in parapsychology and during these talks, on two occasions, I was asked about my doing a combined glossary of parapsychological terms. I turned down both offers for various

reasons, but the fact is that commercial publishers now are getting interested in promoting this type of bibliographic work and that they might constitute one source of publishing.

Secondly, there is another very good reference source list that no one really knows about and it is compiled by Mrs. Babusis at the PF. She has been compiling lists of papers and publications on all sorts of different areas of parapsychology and I would hope that eventually the *Parapsychology Review* would run a list of these compilations that Mrs. Babusis has made. When I was in New York, she showed them to me. She showed me one which had pages and pages of references to literature and periodicals on "out-of-body" experiences, and I would hope that these would become widely available to students.

My third comment is rather a personal one to Miss White. In 1965 you did a paper on "The Library and Psychical Research," in *The Journal of the ASPR*, and it was listed as Part I. For ten years I've been wondering, is there going to be a Part II?

WHITE: I doubt it. You can consider this as Part II.